

Report on the Findings of the NSW Environment Protection Authority's Review of Snowy Hydro Limited Cloud Seeding Program: 2014 Annual Compliance Report



© State of NSW, Environment Protection Authority.

The Environment Protection Authority (EPA) and the State of NSW are pleased to allow this material to be reproduced, for educational or non-commercial use, in whole or in part, provided the meaning is unchanged and its source, publisher and authorship are acknowledged. Specific permission is required for the reproduction of images.

Disclaimer:

The EPA has compiled this document in good faith, exercising all due care and attention. The EPA does not accept responsibility for any inaccurate or incomplete information supplied by third parties. No representation is made about the accuracy, completeness or suitability of the information in this publication for any particular purpose. The EPA shall not be liable for any damage which may occur to any person or organisation taking action or not on the basis of this publication. Readers should seek appropriate advice about the suitability of the information to their needs.

Published by:

NSW Environment Protection Authority (EPA) 59–61 Goulburn Street, Sydney PO Box A290 Sydney South NSW 1232

Report pollution and environmental incidents

Environment Line: 131 555 (NSW only) or info@environment.nsw.gov.au

See also <u>www.epa.nsw.gov.au/pollution</u>

Phone: +61 2 9995 5000 (switchboard)

Phone: 131 555 (NSW only - environment information and publication requests)

Fax: +61 2 9995 5999

TTY users: phone 133 677, then ask for 131 555

Speak and listen users: phone 1300 555 727, then ask for 131 555

Email: info@environment.nsw.gov.au

Website: www.epa.nsw.gov.au

ISBN 978-1-76039-070-9 EPA 2015/0510

October 2015

Table of Contents

			1
1	Exe	cutive summary	2
2	Intro	oduction	3
	2.1	Background	3
	2.2	Purpose	3
3	EP/	A review of Snowy Hydro Limited annual compliance report	4
	3.1	Review	4
	3.2	Findings	4
4	EPA	A 2014 Compliance Audit of Snowy Hydro Limited operations	5
	4.1	Objectives	5
	4.2	Findings	5
5.	Disc	cussion	7
6	Con	clusions and recommendations	8
7.	Apper	ndix 1	9
	7.1 2004	Snowy Hydro Limited compliance with the <i>Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act</i> 9	
	7.2	Snowy Hydro Limited compliance with the Environmental Management Plan 1	2
8.	Apper	ndix 2 – EPA Audit of Snowy Hydro Limited operations1	8
	8.1 <i>2004</i>	Snowy Hydro Limited compliance with the <i>Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act</i> 18	
	8.2	Snowy Hydro Limited compliance with the Environmental Management Plan2	22
	8.3 Opera	Snowy Hydro Limited compliance with the <i>Protection of the Environment</i>	29
	8.4 Trans	Snowy Hydro Limited compliance with the <i>Dangerous Goods (Road and Rail port) Act 2008</i> and Dangerous Goods (Road and Rail Transport) Regulation 2014 3	30

1 Executive summary

Snowy Hydro Limited has been conducting a winter cloud seeding trial in the NSW Snowy Mountains area since 2004. On 31 May 2013 amendments to the *Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004* (the Act) came into effect enabling Snowy Hydro Limited to conduct permanent cloud seeding operations within an expanded area of the Snowy Mountains, in accordance with an Environmental Management Plan approved by relevant Ministers. The Act defines the relevant Ministers as the Minister for the Environment and the Minister for Planning and Environment, who approved the Environmental Management Plan on 5 July 2013. The Act also authorises aerial application of existing and alternative cloud seeding chemicals, and prescribed a review and oversight role for the NSW Environment Protection Authority (EPA). Snowy Hydro Limited is required to provide a report to the EPA detailing its compliance with the Environmental Management Plan and the results of any research and monitoring into the impact of cloud seeding operations on the environment by 31 March each year. The EPA is required to review this report and convey its findings, along with any recommendations, to the Board of the Environment Protection Authority and the relevant Ministers.

The EPA has reviewed Snowy Hydro Limited's annual compliance report for the 2014 cloud seeding season and has found that the compliance report was submitted to the relevant Ministers and the EPA by the due date, and Snowy Hydro Limited has complied with all of its obligations as detailed in the Act and the approved cloud seeding Environmental Management Plan.

The Act also allows the EPA to review on-ground cloud seeding operations and convey these findings, along with any recommendations, to the Board of the Environment Protection Authority and the relevant Ministers. In this regard, the EPA undertook a compliance audit of cloud seeding operations during the 2014 snow-season. The audit found Snowy Hydro Limited met its obligations under the Act and associated Environmental Management Plan, and that operations, procedures and associated environmental monitoring are managed to minimise and/or prevent environmental pollution during cloud seeding operations.

During 2014, a three year investigation of the environmental fate of silver in the Snowy water catchment carried out by the University of Queensland and Snowy Hydro Limited was concluded. The findings of this investigation found no evidence that cloud seeding had increased silver concentrations in the environment, with cloud seeding silver unable to be detected over background levels.

2 Introduction

2.1 Background

Cloud seeding is a process used to improve the capacity of orographic clouds, which are clouds formed as moist air rises over mountains, to yield precipitation as snow. To achieve this, chemical particles are introduced, or seeded, into these clouds. Snowy Hydro Limited (SHL) uses silver iodide as the seeding particle in the Snowy Mountains. Silver iodide has physical properties very similar to natural ice crystals. In addition, silver iodide is practically insoluble in water, tends not to dissociate to its component ions of silver and iodine, and does not become biologically available in the environment. Instead, it remains as a solid in soils and sediments.

During cloud seeding operations, the seeded silver iodide particles combine with naturally occurring supercooled water droplets in the clouds to form ice crystals. These crystals then grow until they become too heavy to stay within the cloud and fall as snow.

To seed the clouds, ground based generators are arranged along the western side of the Snowy Mountain range. The generators are able to disperse minute quantities of the seeding agent into winter storm clouds as they pass across the range. Cloud seeding operations only target cloud systems travelling from west to east and when temperatures guarantee that precipitation will fall as snow above 1,400 metres.

Snowy Hydro Limited has been conducting a winter cloud seeding trial in the NSW Snowy Mountains since 2004. Independent evaluation of the trial indicates that snowfall can be increased by an annual average of 14 per cent through cloud seeding. Environmental monitoring has to date not detected any significant adverse environmental impacts. The 2014 cloud seeding operations comprised 68 hours of cloud seeding between 23 June and 1 August 2014. Approximately 28 kilograms of silver iodide was dispersed during these operations, covering a target area about 2,110 square kilometres.

Under the *Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004* (the Act), cloud seeding operations may only occur in accordance with an Environmental Management Plan that has been jointly approved by the relevant Ministers. This Environmental Management Plan was approved by the relevant Ministers on 5 July 2013.

The Act requires that Snowy Hydro Limited provide an annual report to the NSW Environment Protection Authority (EPA) and the relevant Ministers by 31 March, detailing its compliance with the Environmental Management Plan and the results of any research and monitoring into the impact of cloud seeding operations on the environment. The EPA is required to review this report and convey its findings, along with any recommendations, to the Board of the EPA and the relevant Ministers.

The EPA carried out a review of Snowy Hydro Limited 's 2013 Annual Compliance Report and recommended that it conduct an on-ground audit of Snowy Hydro Limited's cloud seeding operations during the 2014 season.

2.2 Purpose

The purpose of this report is to provide the Board of the EPA and the relevant Ministers with:

- an overview of the findings of the EPA's review of Snowy Hydro Limited's Cloud Seeding Program 2014 Annual Compliance Report in accordance with the Act and the approved Environmental Management Plan, and
- an overview of the findings of the EPA's compliance audit of Snowy Hydro Limited's Cloud Seeding operations during the 2014 season in accordance with the Act and the approved Environmental Management Plan.

3 EPA review of Snowy Hydro Limited annual compliance report

3.1 Review

The EPA has undertaken its review of Snowy Hydro Limited's Annual Compliance Report (the report), in accordance with the Act and the approved Environmental Management Plan. In carrying out its review of the report, the EPA consulted with the Office of Environment and Heritage (OEH) Environment Protection Science section. The EPA also consulted with the National Parks and Wildlife Service (NPWS) in respect to cloud seeding operations that took place within Kosciuszko National Park.

As part of the annual compliance report review, the EPA also assessed the findings of a three year study by researchers from the University of Queensland investigating the environmental fate of silver in the Snowy Water Catchment that were reported in the document titled 'The environmental fate of silver used for cloud seeding in Kosciusko National Park'. The findings of this investigation were presented to representatives of the EPA, OEH and NPWS by the researchers who undertook the investigation in April 2015.

3.2 Findings

The review of the 2014 Annual Compliance report found that:

- Snowy Hydro Limited has complied with all of its obligations as outlined in the Act and the Environmental Management Plan (Appendix 1)
- there were no accidents or breakdowns to report that resulted in spillage of cloud seeding agents or fuel, or failure of controls specified in the Environmental Management Plan
- monitoring was carried out in accordance with the Environmental Management Plan
- analysis of the monitoring data did not detect any evidence of significant adverse environmental impacts associated with cloud seeding activities
- cloud seeding is not having a measurable effect on the concentrations of silver in various parts of the environment
- there were no new operations involving land-based methods of discharge of seeding or tracing agent within any area of land managed under the National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974
- no modifications or new facilities for cloud seeding operations were installed
- the NPWS carried out an inspection and audit of cloud seeding infrastructure within the Kosciuszko National Park on 3 February 2015 and found that overall the sites were in good order and access roads to all sites generally remain in a stable condition.

4 EPA 2014 Compliance Audit of Snowy Hydro Limited operations

4.1 Objectives

The *Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004* prescribes a review and oversight role for the EPA, including the responsibility to review cloud seeding operations, report the findings of the review, and make any necessary recommendations following the review, to the Board of the EPA and the relevant Ministers.

As Snowy Hydro Limited's cloud seeding program was in its second year of permanent operation, the EPA determined it timely to review the cloud seeding program to ensure that the operations and management of the program are compliant and/or consistent with the *Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004* and other relevant acts and regulations, as well as the Environmental Management Plan. This review additionally reflects the recommendation within the 'EPA Review of SHL Cloud Seeding Program: 2013 Compliance Report' to conduct an on-ground audit of Snowy Hydro Limited's cloud seeding operations during the 2014 season.

The EPA's review of Snowy Hydro Limited's cloud seeding operations focussed on cloud seeding operations, procedures and associated environmental monitoring with the Snowy Mountains catchment during 2014. Specifically the review targeted:

- assessment of compliance with the Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004, Protection of the Environment Operations Act 1997, and the Environmental Management Plan
- assessment of the measures Snowy Hydro Limited has in place to minimise or prevent pollution from cloud seeding operations
- examination of the weather and environmental monitoring techniques that are in place
- activities, controls, processes and measures in place at Snowy Hydro Limited's control centre, weather stations, discharge facilities and generators, and during transportation of chemicals and dangerous goods
- current or emerging issues raised by key stakeholders.

Representatives of the EPA conducted an assessment of compliance of the cloud seeding program, which included on-ground inspections of cloud seeding infrastructure and operations during September 2014 and desk top reviews of associated controls, processes and measures in place to prevent pollution and ensure compliance with Snowy Hydro Limited's legislative responsibilities. Additionally, the EPA sought formal input from key stakeholders including the Environmental Protection Science Unit of OEH, NPWS and the National Parks Association of NSW regarding any current or emerging issues with the cloud seeding operations and specific issues relating to the 2014 season.

4.2 Findings

The EPA's review of Snowy Hydro Limited's cloud seeding operations (Appendix 2) found that:

- there was a high level of compliance by Snowy Hydro Limited against obligations under the *Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004*, the *Protection of the Environment Operations Act 1997* and the Environmental Management Plan
- Snowy Hydro Limited had in place established operational procedures and processes to prevent pollution of air, water, noise and land occurring as a result of cloud seeding operations, and controls/measures/processes in place for incident response

- Snowy Hydro Limited meets its legislative obligations for the transport of dangerous goods
- the weather and environmental monitoring techniques and associated controls, procedures and processes Snowy Hydro Limited have in place ensure compliance with legislative obligations
- Snowy Hydro Limited had in place established and documented procedures at the control centre, weather stations, discharge facilities and generators, and for the transportation of chemicals and dangerous goods.

The EPA sought formal input from a range of stakeholders regarding any current or emerging issues resulting from cloud seeding operations. None of the stakeholders consulted reported any issues to the EPA. This is consistent with the 2014 Annual Compliance report which stated that 'No emerging environmental issues have been raised with, or identified by, SHL during this reporting period'.

5. Discussion

During 2014 cloud seeding operations, Snowy Hydro Limited dispersed approximately 28 kilograms of the approved seeding agent, silver iodide, into suitable storm systems. Meteorological conditions experienced in the Snowy Mountains during the 2014 cloud seeding season lead to a decreased usage of silver iodide as opposed to the previous year (45 kilograms). During the 2014 cloud seeding season, there were no new operations involving land-based methods of discharge of seeding or tracing agent within any area of land. There were also no modifications or new facilities installed for cloud seeding operations.

In 2014, Snowy Hydro Limited in conjunction with researchers from the University of Queensland concluded an investigation into the environmental fate of silver in the Snowy water catchment. The findings of the three-year investigation are found within the report titled 'The environmental fate of silver used for cloud seeding in Kosciusko National Park' (Stromsoe et al. 2015a). The study found no conclusive evidence that cloud seeding has increased silver concentrations in the sampled environmental sinks, with cloud seeding silver unable to be detected against background industrial emissions. Briefings to OEH and EPA on these findings by the researchers was provided on 27 April 2015.

The Environmental Management Plan includes an adaptive environmental monitoring program where the future program is informed by the results of the previous environmental monitoring. Based on the analysis of samples collected from 2004 to 2013, the Environmental Management Plan's prescribed five year interval between environmental monitoring programs was found to be appropriate. Therefore, in accordance with the Environmental Management Plan, in 2014 potable water was the only matrix sampled with results indicating the silver concentrations were similar to those from previous years and remain several orders of magnitude below relevant guideline values.

An audit of the infrastructure within Kosciuszko National Park was carried out by the NPWS on 3 February 2015. This audit found that overall the sites were in good order and access roads to all sites generally remain in a stable condition. Additional to this, Snowy Hydro Limited reported that there was no new infrastructure established or decommissioned during the reporting period, no major visual modifications made to existing infrastructure and no accidents or breakdowns to report that resulted in spillage of cloud seeding agents or fuel, or failure of any of the controls specified in the Environmental Management Plan.

The EPA's 2014 Compliance Audit reviewed the range of operational and management plans, programs and protocols in place in relation to Snowy Hydro Limited's cloud seeding program. The EPA's audit found Snowy Hydro Limited currently meets its obligations under the *Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004* and associated Environmental Management Plan, and that operations, procedures and associated environmental monitoring are managed to minimise and/or prevent environmental pollution from the cloud seeding agent and other chemicals used during operations.

While no current or emerging issues were formally raised by stakeholders for the 2014 cloud seeding season, mechanisms within the Environmental Management Plan allow relevant agencies of the Minister for the Environment to request consideration by Snowy Hydro Limited of emerging environmental issues between each five yearly review.

6 Conclusions and recommendations

After reviewing the Snowy Hydro Limited 2014 Annual Compliance Report and Snowy Hydro Limited on-ground operations, the EPA concludes that:

- Snowy Hydro Limited has complied with all of its obligations as detailed in the Act
- Snowy Hydro Limited has complied with all of its obligations as detailed in the Environmental Management Plan for cloud seeding operations approved by the relevant Ministers on 5 July 2013
- Snowy Hydro Limited has complied with all of its obligations as detailed in the Protection of the Environment Operations Act 1997
- management of the cloud seeding sites was found to be of a high standard and consistent with the site controls specified in the approved Environmental Management Plan
- analysis of potable water sampling carried out during the 2014 cloud seeding season showed similar silver concentrations to those in previous years and remain several orders of magnitude below relevant guideline values.

It is recommended that:

- future reviews are also undertaken in consultation with input from partner agencies of the NPWS and OEH
- Snowy Hydro Limited continues to pursue research opportunities on the cloud seeding operations in the Snowy Mountains
- the outcomes of this review are communicated to the relevant Ministers.

7. Appendix 1

7.1 Snowy Hydro Limited compliance with the *Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004*

Obligations under the Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004	Compliance status (report reference)
The area to be primarily targeted for the increased precipitation is land within the Snowy water catchment.	(1.4) Addressed
Operations may be carried out only if there is an approved Environmental Management Plan.	(1.1) Addressed
Operations must be carried out in accordance with the approved Environmental Management Plan (whether being carried out within or outside the Snowy water catchment).	(1) Addressed All operations carried out within the catchment.
The seeding agent used must be an approved seeding agent and used in accordance with the conditions (if any) of its approval as a seeding agent.	(2.2) Addressed
The tracing agent used must be an approved tracing agent and used in accordance with the conditions (if any) of its approval as a tracing agent.	(2.2) Addressed Tracing agent not used.
The seeding agent and tracing agent must be discharged by the use of an approved method.	(2.2) Approved Land-based aerosol generators.
The discharge must be carried out in accordance with the conditions (if any) of its approval as a method of discharge.	(2) Addressed
The discharge of the seeding agent is to be carried out at a time when increased precipitation in the Snowy water catchment is likely to fall as snow at an elevation above 1,400 metres from the mean sea level.	(3.1) Addressed
Snowy Hydro Limited must consult with the NPWS before carrying out any new operations involving a land-based method of discharge of seeding or tracing agent within any area of land reserved under the <i>National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974</i> (that is, operations in an area that has not been the subject of previous consultation with the NPWS).	(2.3) Addressed No new operations carried out.

Obligations under the Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004	Compliance status (report reference)
Snowy Hydro Limited must consult with the NPWS before installing, or carrying out major modifications to, any facilities required to carry out cloud seeding operations within any area of land reserved under the <i>National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974</i> .	(2.3) Addressed No modifications or new installations carried out.
Installation of new facilities for cloud seeding operations must not be carried out within any wilderness area (within the meaning of the <i>National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974</i>).	(2.3) Addressed No new facilities installed.
A seeding agent is not to be discharged from land-based aerosol generators in any wilderness area (within the meaning of the <i>National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974</i>).	(1.4) Addressed All land-based generators located in approved areas by NPWS.
An application for approval of the use of a thing as a seeding agent in cloud seeding operations must be accompanied by details of the health risk assessment carried out in relation to the proposed use of the seeding agent (including the process used to carry out the assessment and the results of the assessment).	(N/A)
An application for approval of the use of a thing as a tracing agent in cloud seeding operations must be accompanied by details of the health risk assessment carried out in relation to the proposed use of the tracing agent (including the process used to carry out the assessment and the results of the assessment).	(N/A)
An application for approval of an Environmental Management Plan must be accompanied by an independent scientific assessment of any proposed cloud seeding operations that differ from the operations currently authorised. Any such scientific assessment must comply with any requirements imposed by the relevant Ministers and notified to Snowy Hydro Limited.	(N/A)

Obligations under the Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004	Compliance status (report reference)
Snowy Hydro Limited must, by 31 March in each year or such later date as agreed by the relevant Ministers, provide a report on its cloud seeding operations during the period of 12 months ending on 31 December in the previous year to the relevant Ministers and to the EPA. Without limiting the generality of subsection (1), the report must contain the following information: (a) details of compliance with the approved Environmental Management Plan (b) details of research concerning, and monitoring of, the impact of tracing agents and seeding agents on the environment (including the findings of any such research or monitoring).	(4) Addressed Report on cloud seeding operations received by EPA 31 March 2015.

7.2 Snowy Hydro Limited compliance with the Environmental Management Plan

Obligations under the Environmental Management Plan	Compliance status (report reference)
Cloud seeding will not commence if the freezing level over the catchment is greater than 1,600 metres, and will be suspended or terminated if the freezing level rises above 1,600 metres during cloud seeding campaigns.	(3.1) N/A Freezing levels above 1,600 metres were never reached.
Additional controls will be implemented when the freezing level is between 1,550 metres and 1,600 metres above sea level, including: (a) video monitoring at locations over the target area at approximately 1,400 metre elevation to assist in determining that precipitation is not falling as rain	(3.1) Addressed Additional controls were implemented during one seeding event.
(b) when required, undertaking telephone polling to external parties and/or Snowy Hydro Limited personnel within the target area to confirm that precipitation is not falling as rain at approximately 1,400 metre elevation	
Snowy Hydro Limited will consult with the NPWS prior to undertaking major vegetation management and site access beyond maintenance of the existing tracks and site footprints.	(2.3) N/A

Obligations under the Environmental Managemen	Compliance status (report reference)
The Annual Compliance Report will include: (a) sample locations, data results, evaluation and adaptive management recommendations for the environmental monitoring program (b) details (including results and evaluation) of an emerging environmental issues (c) results from meteorological monitoring that can demonstrate Snowy Hydro Limited's complian with the requirement to ensure that increased precipitation falls as snow in areas at an elevation above 1,400 metres above sea level (d) results from analyses of downwind precipitation (e) the event time and duration over which cloud seeding occurred (f) any accidents or break downs resulting in spillage of cloud seeding agents, fuel, or failur of controls specified in this Environmental	(a – 4.1-4.4) Addressed (b – 4.5) Addressed No emerging environmental issues. y (c – 3.1) Addressed Table 4. (d – 3.2) Addressed Figure 2. (e – 2.1) Addressed Table 2. (f – 2.3) Addressed No accidents or breakdowns. (g – 2.2) Addressed
Management Plan (g) the quantity of cloud seeding agents that were released per seeding event per generator (h) progress updates on the Environmental Fate Study if relevant (not including any project sensitive information, such as un-published data).	(h – 4.3) Addressed Analysis and final report completed.
In addition to the Annual Compliance Report, Snowy Hydro Limited will also prepare a Cloud Seeding Operations Annual Report which is to be made public available on the Snowy Hydro Limited website within reasonable timeframe after any recommendations fro the Board of the EPA and the relevant Ministers. The Cloud Seeding Operations Annual Report will include but not be limited to:	a m
 summary statistics of the Environmental Monitoring Program details of compliance with approved Environmental Management Plan summary statistics on the overall duration ove which cloud seeding occurred and the total amount of cloud seeding agents that were released over the season. 	r

Obligations under the Environmental Management Plan	Compliance status (report reference)
Disputes between NSW government agencies and Snowy Hydro Limited with regards to cloud seeding operations will be resolved in accordance with the following escalation process:	(2.4) Addressed No disputes between NSW government agencies and SHL.
 use of established paths of communication between Snowy Hydro Limited and the agency (officer to officer) 	O. 1.2.
communication between Snowy Hydro Limited Executive Officer and agency Department Director	
 communication between the Chief Executives of Snowy Hydro Limited and the agency. 	
Snowy Hydro Limited will continue to consult with other relevant land managers with respect to vegetation management and site access. Snowy Hydro Limited will also consult with relevant land managers in situations where major visual modifications are made to infrastructure or if new sites are installed and/or existing sites are removed. No new infrastructure will be established without the prior endorsement by the relevant land manager.	(2.3) Addressed No new infrastructure established, no major visual modifications made to existing infrastructure, and no infrastructure decommissioned.
OEH, the EPA and other identified stakeholders will be advised as soon as practicable following the commencement of, and on the conclusion of cloud seeding campaigns.	(2.1) Addressed OEH and EPA and other identified stakeholders were advised by email.
Existing sites authorised under the Act will be defined by Snowy Hydro Limited (coordinates and identified on a map), and provided to OEH and the EPA prior to commencement of first annual winter operations. Thereafter, prior to the installation of any new authorised sites, updated coordinates and maps are to be provided to OEH and the EPA.	(1.4) Addressed A map of existing sites and details of their coordinates were provided to EPA and OEH in June 2013.

Obligations under the Environmental Management Plan	Compliance status (report reference)		
 Implement all Management Controls (Table 1), being those included for each of the following activities: installation and modification of generators operation and maintenance of generators (including release of cloud seeding agents and increased precipitation) storage and preparation of cloud seeding agents and other chemicals installation and modification of weather stations installation and modification of communications equipment operation and maintenance of weather stations and communications infrastructure operation and maintenance of snow sampling sites Environmental Monitoring Program removal of infrastructure and rehabilitation of sites. 	(2.3) Addressed Infrastructure, including cloud seeding agents and fuel, are managed in accordance with these requirements.		
Meteorological monitoring			
Undertake monitoring of downwind precipitation - mean wintertime daily precipitation anomalies will be updated each year and included in the Annual Compliance Report following cloud seeding operations to continue to monitor downwind precipitation.	(3.2) Addressed Figure 2.		
Snow sampling profile sites and preferred access routes will be defined by Snowy Hydro Limited (coordinates and identified on a map) and provided to OEH and EPA prior to commencement of first annual winter snow sampling operations. Updated coordinates and maps are to be provided to OEH and EPA if sites change.	(1.4) Addressed No snow profile sampling carried out in 2014.		
Environmental chemistry monitoring			
Environmental sampling to be undertaken as per Table 3 in the Environmental Management Plan.	(4.1.2) Addressed Table 5.		

Obligations under the Environmental Management Plan	Compliance status (report reference)
 Specific quality controls applied to the collection and handling of all samples collected for the cloud seeding program include: the use of a new clean plastic vial/bag for each sample the use of a new pair of clean disposable gloves at each site and procedures to minimise contact with the inside of vials/bags to minimise the potential for sample contamination all sampling equipment is washed with ultrapure water or water from the sampling location prior to use the use of a data management system including the barcoding of each sample to ensure every sample is individually trackable from collection, return to base, dispatch to the laboratory and the return of results. 	(4.1.3) Addressed Samples are collected and processed in accordance with internal work instructions and quality assurance and quality control procedures.
Samples sent for laboratory analyses will be analysed for total silver concentration with an appropriate level of quality assurance and quality control (QA/QC).	(4.1.3) Addressed
For those samples that are analysed chemically, the data is to be analysed statistically and interpreted on the basis of three statistical tools.	(4.1.5) Addressed
Implementation of steps in decision tools and environmental suspension criteria.	(4.1.1, 4.1.5) Addressed
The interim and final results of the Environmental Fate study will be provided to OEH and the EPA upon peer-reviewed publication. In addition, if required, briefings on the project will be provided to OEH and the EPA including any recommendations for the adaptive management of the environmental monitoring program.	(4.3) Addressed Final report provided to OEH and EPA at the end of 2014. Stakeholder briefing delivered on 27 April 2015.

Research findings from the study will be used to inform the Environmental Monitoring Program and may result in the improvements to the current program, if required.	(4.3) Addressed	
Macroinvertebrates monitoring		
Sampling will be undertaken on a five-year sampling interval, with the first round of sampling to be undertaken following the first year of cloud seeding operations. In the event that additional river sediment sampling is required as a result of the triggers outlined in Section 5.2.7, macroinvertebrates sampling will also be undertaken at the affected locations.	(4.2) N/A Macroinvertebrate sampling was not required in 2014.	
If macroinvertebrate sampling sites are changed and/or added outside of the Environmental Management Plan Review process, updates to Table 7 will be provided to EPA/OEH prior to sampling being undertaken.	(4.2) N/A Macroinvertebrate sampling was not required in 2014.	
The macroinvertebrate sampling program implemented by Snowy Hydro Limited (and endorsed by OEH) uses the NSW Australian River Assessment System (AUSRIVAS) protocol.	(4.2) N/A Macroinvertebrate sampling was not required in 2014.	
Additional monitoring		
Relevant agencies of the Minister for the Environment may request consideration by Snowy Hydro Limited of emerging environmental issues between reviews of this Environmental	(4.5) N/A No emerging environmental issues	

Management Plan. In order for issues to be considered by Snowy Hydro Limited, the agency will provide a clear outline of the issue to Snowy Hydro Limited based on direct evidence or established scientific theory. The agency and Snowy Hydro Limited will then agree on an appropriate

research/monitoring/consultation/reporting regime.

were raised with, or identified by, SHL during this reporting period.

8. Appendix 2 – EPA Audit of Snowy Hydro Limited operations

8.1 Snowy Hydro Limited compliance with the *Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004*

Obligations under the Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004	Compliance status
The area to be primarily targeted for the increased precipitation is land within the Snowy water catchment.	Compliant EPA reviewed SHL's controls/measures/proces ses in place to target increased precipitation within the target area.
Operations may be carried out only if there is an approved Environmental Management Plan.	Compliant Approved EMP in place.
Operations must be carried out in accordance with the approved Environmental Management Plan (whether being carried out within or outside the Snowy water catchment).	Compliant EPA observed that SHL's operational procedures are centered against commitments within the EMP.
The seeding agent used must be an approved seeding agent and used in accordance with the conditions (if any) of its approval as a seeding agent.	Compliant Silver iodide is the approved seeding agent and was the only agent utilized during the 2014 cloud seeding season.
The tracing agent used must be an approved tracing agent and used in accordance with the conditions (if any) of its approval as a tracing agent.	Compliant SHL reported that a tracing agent was not used in the 2014 cloud seeding season, the approved agent is indium sesquioxide.

Obligations under the Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004	Compliance status
The seeding agent and tracing agent must be discharged by the	Compliant
se of an approved method.	The current approved method of discharge is via land-based generators. During its audit assessment, the EPA inspected a number of land based generators.
The discharge must be carried out in accordance with the	Compliant
nditions (if any) of its approval as a method of discharge.	The EPA noted current discharge points are not located within wilderness areas, and the process and controls around discharges are undertaken in accordance with the EMP.
The discharge of the seeding agent is to be carried out at a time when increased precipitation in the Snowy water catchment is likely to fall as snow at an elevation above 1,400 metres from the mean sea level.	Compliant EPA audit reviewed SHL's controls/measures/proces ses in place to ensure compliance with this criteria
Snowy Hydro Limited must consult with the NPWS before carrying out any new operations involving a land-based method of discharge of seeding or tracing agent within any area of land reserved under the <i>National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974</i> (that is, operations in an area that has not been the subject of previous consultation with the NPWS).	N/A No new operations occurred during 2014 cloud seeding season.
Snowy Hydro Limited must consult with the NPWS before installing, or carrying out major modifications to, any facilities required to carry out cloud seeding operations within any area of land reserved under the <i>National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974</i> .	N/A No major modifications occurred during 2014 cloud seeding season.

Obligations under the Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004	Compliance status
Installation of new facilities for cloud seeding operations must not be carried out within any wilderness area (within the meaning of the National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974).	N/A No major modifications occurred during 2014 cloud seeding season, current discharge points are not located within wilderness areas.
A seeding agent is not to be discharged from land-based aerosol generators in any wilderness area (within the meaning of the National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974).	Compliant No new facilities installed in 2014, current discharge points are not located within wilderness areas.
An application for approval of the use of a thing as a seeding agent in cloud seeding operations must be accompanied by details of the health risk assessment carried out in relation to the proposed use of the seeding agent (including the process used to carry out the assessment and the results of the assessment).	N/A There was no application for approval of an alternative cloud seeding agent in 2014.
An application for approval of the use of a thing as a tracing agent in cloud seeding operations must be accompanied by details of the health risk assessment carried out in relation to the proposed use of the tracing agent (including the process used to carry out the assessment and the results of the assessment).	N/A There was no application for approval of an alternative cloud seeding tracing agent in 2014.
An application for approval of an Environmental Management Plan must be accompanied by an independent scientific assessment of any proposed cloud seeding operations that differ from the operations currently authorised. Any such scientific assessment must comply with any requirements imposed by the relevant Ministers and notified to Snowy Hydro Limited.	N/A for 2014 cloud seeding season

Obligations under the Snowy Mountains Cloud Seeding Act 2004	Compliance status
Snowy Hydro Limited must, by 31 March in each year or such later date as agreed by the relevant Ministers, provide a report on its cloud seeding operations during the period of 12 months ending on 31 December in the previous year to the relevant Ministers and to the EPA. Without limiting the generality of subsection (1), the report must contain the following information:	Compliant Report on cloud seeding operations received by EPA 31 March 2015.
(a) details of compliance with the approved Environmental Management Plan	
(b) details of research concerning, and monitoring of, the impact of tracing agents and seeding agents on the environment (including the findings of any such research or monitoring).	

8.2 Snowy Hydro Limited compliance with the Environmental Management Plan

Obligations under the Environmental Management Plan	Compliance status
Cloud seeding will not commence if the freezing level over the catchment is greater than 1,600 metres, and will be suspended or terminated if the freezing level rises above 1,600 metres during cloud seeding campaigns.	Compliant EPA audit reviewed Snowy Hydro Limited's controls/measures/processes in place to ensure compliance with this criteria.
Additional controls will be implemented when the freezing level is between 1,550 metres and 1,600 metres above sea level, including: (a) video monitoring at locations over the target area at approximately 1,400 metre elevation to assist in determining that precipitation is not falling as rain (b) when required, undertaking telephone polling to external parties and/or Snowy Hydro Limited personnel within the target area to confirm that precipitation is not falling as rain at approximately 1,400 metre elevation.	Complaint EPA audit reviewed Snowy Hydro Limited's controls/measures/processes in place to ensure compliance with this criteria.
Snowy Hydro Limited will consult with the NPWS prior to undertaking major vegetation management and site access beyond maintenance of the existing tracks and site footprints.	N/A The 2014 Annual Compliance Report advised of no major vegetation management or site access activities during the reporting period.

Obligations under the Environmental Management Plan

Compliance status

The Annual Compliance Report will include:

- (a) sample locations, data results, evaluation and adaptive management recommendations for the environmental monitoring program
- (b) details (including results and evaluation) of any emerging environmental issues
- (c) results from meteorological monitoring that can demonstrate Snowy Hydro Limited's compliance with the requirement to ensure that increased precipitation falls as snow in areas at an elevation above 1,4 metres above sea level
- (d) results from analyses of downwind precipitation
- (e) the event time and duration over which cloud seeding occurred
- (f) any accidents or break downs resulting in spillage of cloud seeding agents, fuel, or failure of controls specified in this Environmental Management Plan
- (g) the quantity of cloud seeding agents that were released per seeding event per generator
- (h) progress updates on the Environmental Fate Study if relevant (not including any project sensitive information, such as un-published data).

Compliant

The 2014 Annual Compliance Report included the required information.

In addition to the Annual Compliance Report, Snowy Hydro Limited will also prepare a Cloud Seeding Operations Annual Report which is to be made publicly available on the Snowy Hydro Limited website within a reasonable timeframe after any recommendations from the Board of the EPA and the relevant Ministers. The Cloud Seeding Operations Annual Report will include, but not be limited to:

- summary statistics of the Environmental Monitoring Program
- details of compliance with approved Environmental Management Plan
- summary statistics on the overall duration over which cloud seeding occurred and the total amount of cloud seeding agents that were released over the season.

Compliant

Snowy Hydro Limited prepared and made publically available, a Cloud Seeding Operations Annual Report in 2013.

Compliance status **Obligations under the Environmental Management** Plan N/A Disputes between NSW government agencies and Snowy Hydro Limited with regards to cloud seeding The 2014 Annual operations will be resolved in accordance with the Compliance Report advised following escalation process: no disputes recorded during use of established paths of communication the 2014 cloud seeding between Snowy Hydro Limited and the agency program. (officer to officer) communication between Snowy Hydro Limited Executive Officer and agency Department Director communication between the Chief Executives of Snowy Hydro Limited and the agency. Snowy Hydro Limited will continue to consult with other N/A relevant land managers with respect to vegetation The 2014 Annual management and site access. Snowy Hydro Limited will Compliance Report advised: also consult with relevant land managers in situations no new infrastructure where major visual modifications are made to established, no major visual infrastructure or if new sites are installed and/or existing modifications made to sites are removed. No new infrastructure will be existing infrastructure, and established without the prior endorsement by the relevant no infrastructure land manager. decommissioned. OEH, the EPA and other identified stakeholders will be Compliant advised as soon as practicable following the Notifications for 2014 cross commencement of, and on the conclusion of cloud checked by EPA, confirmed seeding campaigns. receipt for both commencement of, and conclusion of all events. Compliant Existing sites authorised under the Act will be defined by Snowy Hydro Limited (coordinates and identified on a EPA cross check confirmed map), and provided to OEH and the EPA prior to receipt of information by EPA commencement of first annual winter operations. and OEH in June 2013. Thereafter, prior to the installation of any new authorised sites, updated coordinates and maps are to be provided to OEH and the EPA.

Obligations under the Environmental Management Plan

Compliance status

Implement all Management Controls (Table 1), being those included for each of the following activities:

- installation and modification of generators
- operation and maintenance of generators (including release of cloud seeding agents and increased precipitation)
- storage and preparation of cloud seeding agents and other chemicals
- installation and modification of weather stations
- installation and modification of communications equipment
- operation and maintenance of weather stations and communications infrastructure
- operation and maintenance of snow sampling sites
- Environmental Monitoring Program
- removal of infrastructure and rehabilitation of sites.

Compliant

During its on ground assessment, the EPA sighted the range of related management controls/operating procedures for the listed activities.

Undertake monitoring of downwind precipitation - mean wintertime daily precipitation anomalies will be updated each year and included in the Annual Compliance Report following cloud seeding operations to continue to monitor downwind precipitation.

Compliant

The EPA noted/observed the meteorological monitoring program, and associated controls/process and measures in place. The 2014 Annual Compliance Report detailed the required downwind monitoring and analysis information.

Snow sampling profile sites and preferred access routes will be defined by Snowy Hydro Limited (coordinates and identified on a map) and provided to OEH and EPA prior to commencement of first annual winter snow sampling operations. Updated coordinates and maps are to be provided to OEH and EPA if sites change.

N/A

No snow profile sampling was undertaken in 2013 or 2014.

Obligations under the Environmental Management Plan	Compliance status
Environmental sampling to be undertaken as per Table 3 in the Environmental Management Plan.	Compliant EPA noted/observed environmental sampling controls/process and measures in place for sampling, processing and collection. During 2014, potable water was the only matrix sampled (as per the Environment Management Plan).
Specific quality controls applied to the collection and handling of all samples collected for the cloud seeding program include: • the use of a new clean plastic vial/bag for each sample • the use of a new pair of clean disposable gloves at each site and procedures to minimise contact with the inside of vials/bags to minimise the potential for sample contamination • all sampling equipment is washed with ultra-pure water or water from the sampling location prior to use • the use of a data management system including the barcoding of each sample to ensure every sample is individually trackable from collection, return to base, dispatch to the laboratory and the return of results.	Compliant EPA noted/observed environmental sampling controls/process and measures in place (including QA/QC procedures as detailed in the Environment Management Plan).
Samples sent for laboratory analyses will be analysed for total silver concentration with an appropriate level of quality control and quality assurance.	Compliant EPA noted/observed environmental sampling controls/process and measures in place (including QA/QC procedures as detailed in the Environment Management Plan).

Obligations under the Environmental Management Plan	Compliance status
For those samples that are analysed chemically, the data is to be analysed statistically and interpreted on the basis of three statistical tools.	Compliant The Environment Management Plan details the statistical analysis processes and procedures, minimal statistical analysis carried out in 2014 due to extremely low values.
Implementation of steps in decision tools and environmental suspension criteria.	Compliant Due to extremely low values, a more detailed risk assessment was not triggered.
The interim and final results of the Environmental Fate study will be provided to OEH and the EPA upon peer-reviewed publication. In addition, if required, briefings on the project will be provided to OEH and the EPA including any recommendations for the adaptive management of the environmental monitoring program.	Compliant Environmental Fate Study completed in 2014 with briefings provided to stakeholders in April 2015.
Sampling will be undertaken on a five-year sampling interval, with the first round of sampling to be undertaken following the first year of cloud seeding operations. In the event that additional river sediment sampling is required as a result of the triggers outlined in Section 5.2.7, macroinvertebrates sampling will also be undertaken at the affected locations.	N/A In accordance with the Environment Management Plan, macroinvertebrate sampling will take place post 2018 cloud seeding season.
If macroinvertebrate sampling sites are changed and/or added outside of the Environmental Management Plan Review process, updates to Table 7 will be provided to EPA/OEH prior to sampling being undertaken.	N/A In accordance with the Environment Management Plan, macroinvertebrate sampling will take place post 2018 cloud seeding season.
The macroinvertebrate sampling program implemented by Snowy Hydro Limited (and endorsed by OEH) uses the NSW Australian River Assessment System protocol	N/A In accordance with the Environment Management Plan, macroinvertebrate sampling will take place post 2018 cloud seeding season.

Obligations under the Environmental Management Plan	Compliance status
Relevant agencies of the Minister for the Environment may request consideration by Snowy Hydro Limited of emerging environmental issues between reviews of this Environmental Management Plan. In order for issues to be considered by Snowy Hydro Limited, the agency will provide a clear outline of the issue to Snowy Hydro Limited based on direct evidence or established scientific theory. The agency and Snowy Hydro Limited will then agree on an appropriate research/monitoring/consultation/reporting regime.	N/A No requests made during 2014 season.

8.3 Snowy Hydro Limited compliance with the *Protection of the Environment Operations Act 1997*

Environment Operations Act 1991	
Obligations under the Protection of the Environment Operations Act 1997	Compliance status
Air – Air pollution-related sections 124 to 126 (Chapter 5, Part 5.4., Division 1) of the <i>Protection of the Environment Operations Act</i> 1997 require activities to be conducted in a proper and efficient manner, while section 128 (Chapter 5, Part 5.4., Division 1) of the <i>Protection of the Environment Operations Act</i> 1997 requires that all necessary practicable means are used to prevent or minimise air pollution.	Compliant EPA reviewed Snowy Hydro Limited's range of controls/measures/proces ses in place to prevent or minimise air pollution.
Water - It is an offence under section 120 of the <i>Protection of the Environment Operations Act 1997</i> to pollute waters. The definition of 'water pollution' in the <i>Protection of the Environment Operations Act 1997</i> sets out general and specific circumstances that constitute pollution. At its broadest, water pollution means introducing any matter into waters which changes the physical, chemical or biological condition of the water. It also includes placing any matter where it might fall, descend, be washed, be blown or percolates into any waters (e.g. soil which might washed into a waterway).	Compliant EPA reviewed Snowy Hydro Limited's range of controls/measures/proces ses in place to prevent pollution of waters.
Noise - Under the <u>Protection of the Environment Operations Act</u> 1997 the Environment Protection Authority (EPA) is the appropriate regulatory authority responsible for regulating noise from activities scheduled under the Act and activities carried out by public authorities	Compliant EPA reviewed Snowy Hydro Limited's range of controls/measures/proces ses in place to prevent impacts of noise.
Incident potential - There is a duty to report pollution incidents under section 148 of the <u>Protection of the Environment Operations Act 1997</u> .	Compliant EPA reviewed Snowy Hydro Limited's range of systems in place to prevent incidents occurring, and controls/measures/proces ses in place for incident response.
Land contamination - It is an offense to pollute land under section 142(A) of the <i>Protection of the Environment Operations Act 1997</i> .	Compliant EPA reviewed Snowy Hydro Limited's range of controls/measures/proces ses in place to prevent land contamination.

8.4 Snowy Hydro Limited compliance with the *Dangerous Goods* (*Road and Rail Transport*) *Act 2008* and Dangerous Goods (Road and Rail Transport) Regulation 2014

Obligations under the <i>Dangerous Goods (Road and Rail Transport) Act 2008</i> and Dangerous Goods (Road and Rail Transport) Regulation 2014	Compliance status
The EPA regulates the on-road transport of dangerous goods, specifically the requirements regarding placarding, transport documentation, emergency information, stowage, segregation, and safety equipment.	Compliant Silver iodide solution is a dangerous good under the legislation. The EPA undertook an onsite dangerous goods vehicle audit against the legislative requirements for transporting dangerous goods.